THE CRITICAL THINKING IN TAKHRIJ AL-HADITH: A METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

Mohd.Sobri b. Ellias[1], Mohamad Naim Fikri bin Norazmi[2], Mohd Asyran Safwan b. Kamaruzaman[3], Mohd Haidhar Kamarzaman[4]

[1,2]Fakulti Pengajian Quran dan Sunnah, Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia, [3]Akademi Pengajian Islam Kontemporari, Universiti Teknologi Mara Cawangan Negeri Sembilan, [4]Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia

Abstract

The application of critical thinking in takhrij al-hadith is essential in ensuring the authenticity and reliability of hadith, particularly in contemporary Islamic studies. Takhrij al-hadith, as a methodological process of tracing the sources, chains of transmission (sanad), and textual content (matn) of hadith, requires rigorous analytical skills to assess the credibility of narrators and the consistency of transmitted reports. However, the challenge lies in the ability of researchers and scholars to apply a structured critical thinking approach to evaluate hadith comprehensively. The problem arises when certain hadith are misinterpreted or taken out of context due to the lack of a systematic method in assessing their authenticity. This study aims to explore the role of critical thinking in takhrij al-hadith, focusing on how logical reasoning, skepticism, and analytical evaluation can enhance the authentication process. The research will employ a qualitative methodology, utilizing library research, content analysis, and a comparative study of classical and contemporary hadith authentication methods. The expected findings will demonstrate that integrating critical thinking into takhrij al-hadith not only strengthens the authentication process but also minimizes the risk of misinformation and misapplication of hadith in contemporary discourse.

Keywords: *critical thinking, takhrij al-hadith, transmission, evaluate, authenticity.*

INTRODUCTION

The science of *takhrij al-hadith* or '*ilm takhrij al-hadith* is a science of *hadith* compiled by scholars to determine the position of a *hadith* in terms of its strength and weakness and to curb the spread of hadiths *mawdu'*[1] or false hadiths that are created subtly by certain groups in the Muslim community. Some

---

[1] *Mawdu'* hadith, from a terminological perspective, refers to a fabricated and falsely attributed hadith to the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him). Besides being the worst form of weak hadith *(da'if)*, it is also strictly prohibited to be used as evidence in matters of creed (*aqidah*) or Islamic jurisprudence. The fabrication of hadith began as early as 41 AH, during the caliphate of the fourth Caliph, Sayyidina 'Ali karramallahu wajhah. Scholars have elaborated on the reasons behind the emergence of fabricated hadiths, among which are:

1. Political disputes, such as the *Al-Rafidah* group, who fabricated hadiths to serve their own interests.
2. Acts by those who despised Islam, including leaders or individuals who had lost power in the Islamic government.
3. Fanaticism towards race, tribe, language, region, and imams.
4. The fabrication of stories and narratives by those who shamelessly used the name of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) to attract people to listen to their tales (*al-qussas*)
5. Sectarian and ideological conflicts, including disputes over opinions in matters of Islamic jurisprudence (*fiqh*) and theology (*kalam*).
6. Ignorance of Islam despite good intentions, which occurred among some individuals who claimed to be part of the Sufi (*mutasawwif*) circles.
7. Personal interests, such as seeking favour with rulers or economic gain including businessmen fabricating hadiths about the merits of their products. In addition to these intentional causes, scholars also recognize several unintended and non-malicious factors that contributed to the spread of *mawdu'* hadiths:

elements of critical thinking are found to be useful to be used as an instrument to evaluate a *hadith*. Elements such as the skills to analyze and evaluate the information as an important basis for the formulation of knowledge with the intention to solve problems related to the falsification of *hadiths* that is happening in the Muslim society, or to make a decision about the position of the *hadith*. This paper will set out the elements and to prove that this knowledge can be the basis underlying the argument that the *hadiths* which are being practiced by the majority of Muslims today have gone through a careful and thorough examination process before they are eligible to serve as a secondary reference to followers of Islam throughout the world.

CRITICAL THINKING: CONCEPTUAL EXPLANATION

The concept of "thinking" refers to the process of thinking[2] and among the main aims of this process is to solve problems or make decisions centered on the principles of right and proper reasoning/thinking. According to J.A. Phillips, a number of experts have agreed in general, that 'thinking' is a process of mental operation that acts in the mind of a person to solve problems and/or make decisions. According to him, these mental operations is "thinking skills" acting on information received through the various senses of the individual[3].

The term critical thinking has been variously defined by various parties, especially by reknown Western scholars such as John Dewey, Edward Glaser, Michael Scriven and others. Michael Scriven stated that "*critical thinking is skilled and active interpretation and evaluation of observations and communications, information and argumentation*"[4]. John Arul Phillips, in explaining critical thinking, says that the one who thinks critically is the one who able to evaluate the basis of ideas, proposals, actions and solutions. A person who can think critically can also make an assessment whether to accept an excuse as reasonable, or otherwise. Therefore, critical thinking reminds individuals to be careful and thorough by analyzing a statement carefully and seek valid evidences before making a decision[5].

To think critically, as a concept, involves a network of serious thinking, in-depth thinking, to make any judgment, analysis, synthesis and detailed evaluation, reflective thinking to decide whether to accept or to reject something, holistic thinking to view problems from various angles, as well as to think

---

8. Zealous promotion of virtue without authentic basis, whereby some individuals believed that fabricating hadiths to encourage prayer, fasting, or other good deeds was excusable a notion firmly rejected by the scholars of hadith.

9. Narrating without verification, especially by preachers and orators who lacked rigorous training in *'ilm al-hadith*, leading to the unintentional transmission of fabricated or unverified texts.

10. Confusion between sayings of scholars and prophetic reports, where the statements of companions, tabi'in, or pious predecessors were mistakenly attributed to the Prophet ﷺ.

11. Mistaken attribution due to weak memory or paraphrasing, in which narrators conveyed the meaning of hadiths without precision, thus distorting the original wording.

12. Merging of *Isra'iliyyat* and local wisdom into Islamic discourse, where historical or moral anecdotes from Jewish or Christian traditions were mistaken as hadiths and circulated within the community.

13. Reliance on forged written manuscripts, particularly in early generations when access to reliable scholars and authenticated collections was limited. These diverse causes—whether deliberate or unintentional—highlight the importance of hadith authentication (*takhrij, jarh wa ta'dil*) and the indispensable role of scholars in protecting the Sunnah from distortion. Among the key books that document fabricated hadiths is *Al-Mawdu'at*, authored by Abu al-Faraj 'Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Jawzi. For further details, refer to: Subhi al-Salih, Dr. (1959), *'Ulum al-Hadith wa Mustalahuh: 'Ard wa Dirasat*, Beirut: Dar al-'Ilm li al-Malayin, 1st edition, pp. 263-271. Muhammad 'Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1988), *Al-Sunnah Qabla al-Tadwin*, Cairo: Maktabah Wahbah, 2nd edition, p. 189.Abdul Halim El-Muhammady (1992), *Islam dan al-Hadith: Dialog Bersama Kassim Ahmad; Satu Analisis ke atas Usaha-usaha Merosakkan Peribadi dan Autoriti Rasulullah s.a.w.*, (n.p.), Angkatan Belia Islam [ABIM], 2nd edition, p. 113.

2 *Kamus Dewan (*2007), 4th edition, Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka, p. 411.

3 John arul Phillips (1997), *Teaching Thinking Skills*: Theory and Practice, Kuala Lumpur: Utusan Publications & Distributors Sdn Bhd, p. 72.

4 Fisher, Alec (202), *Critical Thinking: An Introduction*, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, p. 11.

5 John Arul Phillips (1997), *op. cit.*, p. 84.

efficiently to evaluate the reasonableness and fairness of an idea. These skills are essential, especially in the interpretation of a fact and evaluate an observation and information acquired by a person, Bassham explains its meaning in greater detail as follows:

> "*critical thinking is the general term given to a wide range of cognitive skills and intellecual dispositions needed to effectively identify, analyze, and evalute arguments and truth claims, to discover and overcome personal prejudices and biases, to formulate and present convincing reasons in support of conclusions, and to make reasonable, intelligent decisions about what to believe and what to do*"[6].

Although there are many definitions of critical thinking, but in terms of concept, they do not contradict the concept of thinking advocated by the Qur'an and the *Sunnah*. There are a number of verses in the Qur'an which encourage people to think like al-Baqarah (02): 219, 242 dan 266, ali 'Imran (03): 118, al-An'am (06): 50 dan 32, al-'Araf (07): 184 dan 169, Yusuf (12): 109, al-Mu'minun (23): 80, al-Nur (24): 61, al-Rum (30): 08, al-Saffat (37): 137-138 and al-Hadid (57): 17. For example, Allah says in Quran:

﴿يَسْأَلُونَكَ عَنِ الْخَمْرِ وَالْمَيْسِرِ ۖ قُلْ فِيهِمَا إِثْمٌ كَبِيرٌ وَمَنَافِعُ لِلنَّاسِ وَإِثْمُهُمَا أَكْبَرُ مِن نَّفْعِهِمَا ۗ وَيَسْأَلُونَكَ مَاذَا يُنفِقُونَ قُلِ الْعَفْوَ ۗ كَذَٰلِكَ يُبَيِّنُ اللَّهُ لَكُمُ الْآيَاتِ لَعَلَّكُمْ تَتَفَكَّرُونَ﴾

Translation: They ask you about wine and gambling. Say, "In them is great sin and [yet, some] benefit for people. But their sin is greater than their benefit". And they ask you what they should spend. Say, "The excess [beyond needs]". Thus Allah makes clear to you the verses [of revelation] that you might give thought"

Also the verse:

﴿يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَتَّخِذُوا بِطَانَةً مِّن دُونِكُمْ لَا يَأْلُونَكُمْ خَبَالًا وَدُّوا مَا عَنِتُّمْ قَدْ بَدَتِ الْبَغْضَاءُ مِنْ أَفْوَاهِهِمْ وَمَا تُخْفِي صُدُورُهُمْ أَكْبَرُ ۚ قَدْ بَيَّنَّا لَكُمُ الْآيَاتِ ۖ إِن كُنتُمْ تَعْقِلُونَ﴾

Translation: "O you who have believed, do not take as intimates those other than yourselves, for they will not spare you [any] ruin. They wish you would have hardship. Hatred has already appeared from their mouths, and what their breasts conceal is greater. We have certainly made clear to you the signs, if you will use reason"

Also the verse:

﴿أَوَلَمْ يَتَفَكَّرُوا فِي أَنفُسِهِم ۗ مَّا خَلَقَ اللَّهُ السَّمَاوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ وَمَا بَيْنَهُمَا إِلَّا بِالْحَقِّ وَأَجَلٍ مُّسَمًّى ۗ وَإِنَّ كَثِيرًا مِّنَ النَّاسِ بِلِقَاءِ رَبِّهِمْ لَكَافِرُونَ﴾

Translation: "Do they not contemplate within themselves? Allah has not created the heavens and the earth and what is between them except in truth and for a specified term. And indeed, many of the people, in [the matter of] the meeting with their Lord, are disbelievers".

However, the point of difference between the concept of thinking of followers of Islam and the concept of thinking that is practiced by non-Muslims is, Islam places revelation as a key reference in verifying whether something is good or bad, while the non-Muslims simply put reasoning or ethics and moral of the members of their society as a measure in evaluating a matter positive or negative.

---

[6] Bassam, Greg, et.al. (2002), *Critical Thinking*, USA: Mc Graw-Hill Companies, Inc., p. 1.

Muslim scholars such as Yusuf al-Qaradawi prefer to use the term *'intelligence/learned mind' (al-'aqliyyah al-'ilmiyyah)*[7] over the more modern expression *'critical thinking' (al-tafkir al-naqdi)*, as used by figures like 'Aidh al-Qarni[8]. The concept of *al-'aqliyyah al-'ilmiyyah*, as emphasized by al-Qaradawi, refers to a mode of reasoning that is grounded in knowledge, discernment, and evaluation characterized by careful examination of truth and avoidance of blind acceptance.

Likewise, Muhammad Mahran highlights the importance of avoiding irrational or unexamined thought patterns, advocating instead for *systematic thinking (al-tafkir al-munazzam)* [9], which is essential to any form of critical engagement[10]. In this context, the term *balanced thinking (al-tafkir al-mizani)* is proposed as a more accurate and Qur'anically grounded alternative to conventional critical thinking. It emphasizes intellectual fairness and equilibrium in evaluating ideas and arguments. al-Ghazali also advocates this approach in his work *al-Qistas al-Mustaqim*, where he formulates principles of *al-tafkir al-mizani* directly from the Qur'an to guide sound reasoning. This framework remains relevant in contemporary discourse, especially in countering irrational or biased interpretations of religious teachings without the need for polemical confrontation.

Based on some of the definitions given above, it can be concluded that the concept of critical thinking involves a number of macro and micro skills, as is evident in some versions of the definitions presented above. Macro skills of critical thinking can be formulated based on Bloom's taxonomy to include three types of mental activities, that is, analysis, synthesis and evaluation. Ability to evaluate is the the basis for critical thinking, that is, to evaluate the validity of any information or matter. This is because the term 'critical' itself refers to 'an attribute a person possesses to argue, to conclude, and also to reach a decision based on facts or information analyzed[11].

Based on some versions of the definition of 'critical thinking', it can be concluded that critical thinking involves the elements mentioned above and focuses on several major issues to analyze any information or matters, and to evaluate the extent to which this information can be accepted as valid and reliable. This is because the term 'critical' itself refers to 'the nature of a person to argue, to conclude, and to arrive at a decision based on facts or information which have been analyzed[12]'. The standards in critical thinking considered are elements such as clarity of an argument (clarity), accuracy, relevance, consistency, logicality, depth and completeness of thought, fairness/objectivity (fairness) and the significance of an argument.[13]

Thus, this paper is an attempt at examining the importance of these skills as applied in the tradition of *takhrij al-hadith* knowledge, especially in evaluating the *hadith* to determine the extent to which a text (*matn*: the content which reports the teaching or the incident) can be accepted as the text (*matn*) of hadith or not. Of course, there are certain rules used by the scholars to determine the position of a *hadith*, and certainly as implied in these rules a number of critical skills are employed. It would be appropriate if in the tradition of the study of *hadith*, especially in the study of *takhrij al-hadith*, that the students are exposed to these elements to enable them to master both methodological as well as critical thinking skills.

---

[7] Al-Qaradawi, Yusuf, Dr. (1996), *al-'Aql wa al-'Ilm fi al-Qur'an al-Karim,* Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah, p. 249.
[8] Al-Qarni, 'Iwad ibn Muhammad, Dr. (1418 H.), *Hatta la Takun Kallan*, Jeddah:Dar al-Andalas al-Khadra, p. 93.
[9] *Ibid.*
[10] Muhammad Mahran Rasywan (2004), *Dirasat fi al-Mantiq 'inda al-'Arab*, Kaherah: Dar Quba' li al-Tiba'ah wa al-Nasyr wa al-Tawzi', p. 194
[11] Mohd Yusof Othman (1998), "Generating Scientific, Critical and Creative Thinking" in *PEMIKIR*, October-December, pp. 67-68.
[12] *Ibid.*
[13] *Ibid.*, p. 2-7. See also W. Paul, Richard & Elder, Linda (2002), *Critical Thinking*, New Jersey: Financial Times Prentice Hall, p. 97-108.

TAKHRIJ AL-HADITH: CONCEPTUAL AND HISTORICAL HIGHLIGHTS

The study of *hadith* or *'Ulum al-hadith* is an important area of study in the tradition of Islamic scholarship. It seeks to preserve the purity and authenticity of the *hadith* which has become the secondary source of reference after the Qur'an. Therefore, a thorough examination and screening of the *hadiths* is necessary because apart from the Qur'an, the hadiths which are collected by the high priests of *hadith*, especially al-Bukhari and Muslim, also provide the appropriate knowledge about Islam.[14]

The importance of verifying hadith through *sanad* (chain of narrators) and *takhrij* (referencing sources) has long been emphasized by early Muslim scholars as a means to preserve the authenticity of the Sunnah. Muhammad ibn Sirin (d. 110H), a prominent Tabi'i, is famously reported to have said, *"This knowledge is religion, so look carefully from whom you take your religion."* He also stated, *"They did not used to ask about the isnad, but when the fitnah (trial) happened, they said: Name to us your men"*[15] (Muslim, *Muqaddimah Sahih Muslim*). Likewise, 'Abdullah ibn al-Mubarak (d. 181H) declared, *"Isnad is part of the religion. Were it not for the isnad, anyone would say whatever he wishes."*[16] These statements reflect the early Muslims' deep commitment to ensuring that only authentic reports were accepted and propagated, especially in an era when fabricated narrations had begun to emerge.

Contemporary scholars have continued to uphold the critical importance of *sanad* and *takhrij* studies in hadith scholarship. Scholars such as Dr. Muhammad 'Ajjaj al-Khatib[17] and Dr. Mahmud Tahhan[18] have systematically outlined the principles of hadith evaluation to prevent the spread of weak or fabricated narrations. The discipline of *takhrij*, which involves locating the origin of hadiths across classical sources, is essential in filtering authentic reports from unreliable ones. In an age of information overload, including mass dissemination of unauthenticated hadiths on digital platforms, the application of *takhrij* has become even more vital. It ensures that contemporary Muslims rely on sound religious foundations, thereby continuing the tradition of intellectual rigour exemplified by early hadith scholars.

Thus, it is not surprising that this tradition is adhered to with full academic dedication, carefully, objectively, and sincerely by Islamic scholars in this field. The methods developed in this discipline are based on the fundamentals of high level critical thinking and these features are sometimes not fulfilled by some Western scholars, as stated by Khurram Jah Murad as follows;

> "Unfortunately scholarship, sincerity and objectivity, is the one thing that does not seem to have ever been employed in the study of *hadith* by a Western scholar.[19]."

One of the important knowledges that was developed by Muslim scholars associated with the *'Ulum al-hadis* is the method of *takhrij al-hadith* or *hadith*. *Takhrij*, from the point of language is derived from the word خرج, which means out[20]. Whereas if one were to look at the sentence خرج and أخرج and it will lead to the issue of affixation referred to as the noun, that is, تخريج and إخراج meaning to produce, to

---

[14] About this position, Yasin Dutton wrote;

> "… knowledge of Islam, and thus Islamic law, is effectively restricted to a knowledge of the texts of the Qur'an and the *hadith*, in particular the collections of al-Bukhari and Muslim, although with some recognition of the other four of the 'Six Books', i.e. the collections of al-Tirmidhi, Abu Dawud, al-Nasa'i, and Ibn Majah, which are what are most commonly seen today as the main sources of Islamic law". Lihat Yasin Dutton (1993), "Sunna, Hadith, and Madinan 'Amal", *Journal of Islamic Studies* 4: 1 (1993) p 1.

[15] Muslim ibn al-Hajjaj. (n.d.). *Sahih Muslim* (Muqaddimah). Beirut: Dar Ihya' al-Turath al-'Arabi, p. 15.

[16] *Ibid.* p. 14.

[17] al-Khatib, M. 'A. (2001). *Usul al-Hadith: 'Ulumuhu wa Mustalahuhu*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr al-Mu'asir, p. 200.

[18] Tahhan, M. (2004). *Taysir Mustalah al-Hadith*. Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, p. 77.

[19] Khurram Jah Murad's Introduction, in Ahmad Don Denffer (1981), *Literature on Hadith in European Languages: A Bibliography,* Leicester: The Islamic Foundation, p. 6.

[20] Majma' al-Lughah al-'Arabiyyah (1425H/2004AD), *al-Mu'jam al-Wasit*, Egypt: Maktabat al-Shuruq al-Dawliyyah, p. 224-225. See also Abu Muhammad 'Abd al-Muhdi bin 'Abd al-Qadir (t.t), *Turuq Takhrij Hadith Rasul Allah s.a.w,* Cairo: Dar al-'Itisam, p. 9.

display and to disclose something[21]. While the word *al-hadith* in etimological terms, means something new. In terms of terminology, the *al-hadith* is defined as something that is attributed to the Prophet, consisting of his words, acts, recognition, character[22] and life history[23].

Therefore, it can be concluded that *takhrij al-hadith* means "based on a certain *hadith* with its *isnad* (chain of transmitters) to the original books of *Hadith,* as well as indicating its position after being reviewed and considered its position in terms of authority and substance[24]," or in more simple language, states the meaning of "*takhrij al-hadith*" as "stating the resources and report the *hadith* based on its authority (*bayan al-masadir allati rawat al-hadith bi sanadih*)[25]". With this understanding, the term '*takhrij'* here means something that is removed from the *hadith* with [the stated] going back to all reliable works in the hadith literature (*musnad-musnad*)[26] and explain its validity or otherwise *(ma yustakhraj min al-ahadith bi isnadiha min al-kutub al-mu`tamadah wa masanid al-muhaddithin wa bayan sihhatiha wa ghayriha)*[27]. *Takhrij* also includes what is being added by the *muhaddithin mutaakhkhirin* from the *hadith* that has been added by reknown past *hadiths* in their works but by his own *sanad* as has been done by al-Imam al-Dar Qutni (d. 385H), in his work reporting the *hadith* from Abu Ishaq al-Naysaburi (m. 362H)[28].

A brief description of the meaning of *takhrij al-hadith*, not only explains more about this knowledge, but also its importance as a mechanism to vet the unidentified reporters of the *hadith* based on certain rules established by the scholars. The importance of this knowledge will be more clearly understood if one were to look at its historical background against the emergence of science in the Islamic world.

In the Islamic world, activities of *takhrij al-hadith* took place during the early three centuries of Islam, namely in the form of a *al-muhaddith* mentioning *hadith* along his *isnad* until it reached Prophet Muhammad, either by recording them in notes form or works or verbally mentioned in *halaqat al-hadis* (study circle), managed by reknown scholars[29] or both[30]. This is the elementary/basic stage in one's effort to *takhrij* the *Hadith*. This is followed by the stabilization stage, a stage in which a *al-muhaddith* accommodates *hadith* taken from previous scholars and *takhrij* his *hadith* one by one by maintaining the scholar's *sanad* concerend, then the *sanad* is reffered to other *sanad,* and the point of convergence between the *sanads* will be the teacher of the first scholar or the next, but this is also the case at the companions stage[31]. At this stage, the *al-muhaddith* uses the term *istikhraj.* However, according to Abu

---

[21] Muhammad Abu Layth al-Khayr Abadi, Dr. (2004), *Takhrij al-Hadith Nasy'atuh wa Manhajiyyatuh*, Kuala Lumpur: Dar al-Syakir, p. 6-7. See also Majd al-Din Muhamad bin Ya'kub al-Fayruz Abadi (1987), *Qamus al-Muhith*, Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, p. 192.

[22] al-Tahhan, Mahmud, Dr.*,* (t.t) *Taysir Mustalah al- Hadith*, Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma`arif, p. 15. What is meant by the nature of the Prophet is the nature of his event and the nature of his personality, see Nur al-Din `Itr, Dr. (1997), *Manhaj al-Naqd fi`Ulum al- Hadith*. cet. 3, Beirut & Damascus: Dar al-Fikr al-Mu`asir & Dar al-Fikr, p. 26.

[23] Manna` al-Qattan (1989), *Tarikh al-Tasyri`-al-Islami*. Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah, p. 72.

[24] Abu Bakr 'Abd al-Samad b. Bakr Ali 'Abid, Dr. (1422H), *al-Madkhal ila Takhrij al-Ahadith wa al-Athar wa al-Hukm 'alaiha*, al-Madinah al-Munawwarah: (t.t.p), p. 13.

[25] Nur al-Din `Itr (1976), *Mu`jam al-Mustalahat al-Hadithiyyah* . Damsyiq: Matba`ah Jami`ah Dimasyq, p. 25.

[26] It means a book in which hadiths are collected, arranged in an orderly manner and placed in chapters with their chain of transmission, for example the Musnad of Imam Ahmad; what is collected in it is the musnad of each companion one by one, whether authentic or weak; also used for the meaning of isnad (the reliance of a hadith on the person who stated the hadith), for example the *Musnad of Shihab* and the *Musnad of al-Firdaws* which means the chain of transmission of the hadith of both of them. `Ali Zuwayn, Dr. (1987), *Mu`jam Mustalahat Tawthiq al-Hadith*. Beirut: 'Alam al-Kutub & Maktabah al-Nahdah al-`Arabiyyah, p. 78.

[27] 'Ali Zuwayn, Ibid, p. 19.

[28] Fauzi Deraman, (2001), "The Science of Takhrij al-Hadith, Its Definition, History and Importance", *Usuluddin Journal*, No. 14 p. 58.

[29] Among the figures who handled the halaqat-halaqat al-hadith are Anas b. Malik, Abu al-Darda', Abu Waqid al-Laythi, 'Abd Allah b. 'Amr, 'Umar al-Khattab, Abu Musa al-Asya'riy, Jabir b. 'Abd Allah, Ibn Shihab and many others. See Muhammad Mustafa al-A'zami (1985), *op.cit.*, vol. 2, p. 329-333.

[30] *Ibid.*

[31] Fauzi Deraman (2001), *op. cit.*, p. 61; See also Abu Muhammad 'Abd al-Muhdi (t.t), *op. cit.*, p. 10.

Muhammad 'Abd al-Muhdi, the words *isikhraj* and *takhrij* have the same meaning in his book *Turuq Takhrij Hadith the Messenger of Allah's* ﷺ [32].

Next is the stage where an *al-muhaddith* creates a collection of *hadith* reported by his teachers, then examined and revised by the previous scholar, reporting the *hadith* as scholars from among the authors of *al-Kutub al-Sittah*. This effort was led by al-Imam al-Dar Qutni (d. 385H) and reached its peak during the time of al-Imam al-Bayhaqi (d. 485H)[33]. There were a number of leading figures of *al-muhaddithin* among the *al-muta'akhkhirin* who were involved in this effort apart from al-Imam al-Dar Qutni and al-Imam al-Bayhaqi. Among the others were Abu al-Fath Muhammad bin Ahmad Ibn Abi al-Fawaris al-Baghdadi (d. 412H), Abu Sa'id 'Ali ibn Musa al-Naysaburi (d. 465H), Abu 'Abd Allah bin Husayn Ahmad Ibn al-Baqqal (d. 477H) Abu Tahir Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Ahmad al-Asbahani (d. 576H) and many others[34].

The development of '*ilm takhrij al-hadith* reaches its highest point with the publication of a number of works known as the *takhrij* book that are still in existence. These books are written based on the same method, that is: perform the *takhrij hadith* on *hadiths* that have been included in the book based on the original source of opinion of *hadith* as well as being briefly expressed or discussed about the status of the *hadith* in terms of validation and nullification. This effort is further expanded actively and rapidly until the publication of the works of *takhrij al-hadith* that are available now.

Based on a study by Muhammad Abu al-Layth, there are as many as 36 papers, including several studies that are completed as academic exercises in this area, academic exercises submitted at masters or doctoral level in various institutions of higher learning in Saudi Arbia[35]. Among the famous books in the field of *Takhrij al-Hadith* are books entitled *Usul al-Takhrij wa Dirasat al-Asanid* by Dr. Mahmud al-Tohhan; *Takhrij al-Hadith*: *Nasya'tuhu wa Manhajiyyatuh;* an essay by Dr. Muhammad Abu Laith al-Khair Abadi; *Kasyf al-Litham 'an asrar Takhrij al-Hadith Sayyid al-Anam,* an essay by Dr. 'Abd al-Mawjud Muhammad' Abd al-Latif*; al-Madkhal ila Takhrij al-Ahadith wa al-Athar al-Hukm 'Alayha,* essay by Dr. Abu Bakr ; *'Abd al-Samad 'Ali 'Abid, al-Ta'sil li usul al-Takhrij*, an essay by Abu Bakr bin 'Abd Allah Abu Zayd; *Husul al Tafrij bi Usul al-Takhrij,* an essay by Syaikh Ahmad bin Muhammad bin al-Siddiq al-Ghumari, and many more[36].

There are several approaches or methods that have been outlined by religious scholars in the conduct of *takhrij* on a *hadith* issued. Among the methods and approaches that can be used are to know the highest *rawi al-hadith* [among his friends] for a *hadith*, or to identify the early pronouncement from the true *hadith*, or to find out the declaration that is rarely used (*gharib al-hadith*) or obtained from any part of the true *al-hadith*, or by using the title and chapter that expresses the *hadith,* or to make an evaluation about the *hadith* from the view of *sanad* and truth, either from the perspective of types of *hadith* or the position of *hadith* such as *sahih, hasan, da'if* and others, or to carry out *takhrij* by using the *tatabbu'* and *al-Istiqra'* methods; that is to trace a *hadith* by examining one by one every page of the real or true *al-hadith,* and page by page until the end[37].

Based on the above description, it can be concluded that *takhrij al-hadith* which focuses on activities that stating the resources of the *hadith* which is reported by an authoritative reporter of sources of *hadith* to determine the position of a *hadith* whether it can be used as an authentic *hadith*, or vice versa, is based on specific rules outlined by Islamic scholars. This knowledge has gone through several phases of development until it is established as it is now. In the method used to *takhrij* a *hadith*, the study of true *hadith* and *sanad* of reporters is given due attention. This means that the evaluation process

---

[32] Abu Muhammad 'Abd al-Muhdi bin 'Abd al-Qadir (t.t), *op. cit.,* p. 9.
[33] Muhammad Abu al-Layth al-Khayr Abadi, Dr. (1999), *op. cit.,* p. 26-27.
[34] *Ibid.,* p. 27-28.
[35] *Ibid.,* p. 29-36.
[36] *Ibid.*
[37] For more information, please refer to Muhammad Abu al-Layth al-Khayr Abadi, Dr., (1999), *op. cit.*, p. 41-42; Abu Muhammad `Abd al-Muhdi bin `Abd al-Qadir (t.t), *op. cit.*, p. 15.

critically emphasizes the importance of critical thinking in the *takhrij* process. Thus, the conditions set by the scholars in determining the credibility of a reporter and the admissibility of a true *hadith* being discussed in other disciplines in the `*Ulum al-hadith*, and `*ilm rijal al-hadith*[38] and '*lm 'aljarh awa al - ta'dil* be linked. This issue will be discussed further.

APPLICATION OF CRITICAL THINKING IN *TAKHRIJ AL-HADITH*

If critical thinking means to examine something based on the concept and domain as explained above, it can be concluded that that such type of dynamic thinking as critical thinking naturally is a method of *takhrij hadith*. This is because the element of a critical evaluation of an original and true *hadith* is being given a lot of emphasis. An individual should be educated in order to be more inclined to make a clear and in-depth analysis about the source of opinion about a *hadith,* besides an in-depth evaluation before adopting a *hadith*. Initial observation by the author shows that the elements of critical thinking have been interpreted in the discipline of *takhrij hadith*, in order to ensure that the authenticity and authority of the *hadith* is maintained besides it being a significant alternative in dealing with fraudulent polemics in the Islamic world since ages. Next, the author will try to clarify the extent to which critical thinking instruments such as analytical skills, an objective method of thinking and skills in making ethical evaluation of *takhrij al-hadith* activities.

With reference to analytical thinking skills, and in the tradition of Islamic knowledge, it is first suggested that its followers be more analytical and thorough in terms of sourcing information from a certain source as has been stated before[39]. This recommendation is subsequently implemented effectively by the *al-muhaddith* not only when conducting activities accepting and reporting a *hadith*, it is an important ethics in the process of *takhrij al-hadith*. Amongst the ethics that are being strongly emphasized by the *al-muhaddith* when working on *takhrij al-hadith* is the need to be careful in locating the original source to support a version of the *hadith*. The *tabi'en,* for example, stressed heavily on the question of *isnad* in a version of a *hadith*. For example, *al-Zuhri* has said, "It is not possible to reach the roof of a house unless by using a ladder [that is, *isnad*][40]". With regard to *isnad,* Ibn al-Mubarak said, "*Isnad* includes religion. If there is no *isnad*, then anyone can say anything he wants[41]". While Hisham b. 'Urwah said, "If a person reports a *hadith* to you then you ask the person concerned, from where this *hadith*" [referring to the source of the *hadith*][42].

That was what happened in the days of *tabi'en*, connected chain (*muttasil al-isnad*) was their concern that all the reporters of *hadith* who wanted to narrate a *hadith* should explain the source of the *hadith* concerned. Some of them have likened *hadith* narrated without *isnad* is like a house without a roof and pillars[43]. This shows that a detailed analysis will be performed by individuals who are involved in narrating the *hadith* [*al-Muhaddith*] to see the original version of a *hadith* and to evaluate the validity

---

[38] This science evaluates the quality of hadith narrators in the transfer of hadiths made by them from one narrator to another narrator (*a science of evaluating the qualities of narrators of hadiths in their transmission of hadiths*). Iftikhar Zaman commented on the importance of this knowledge in evaluating the hadith as follows;
> "Evaluating the factual contents of hadiths with the use of such a science will lead to results which are much more reliable than any of the methods modern scholars have proposed for the study of hadiths".
For further discussion about the position of `ilm al-rijal as a method in the study of hadith, see Iftikhar Zaman (1994), "The Science of Rijal as a Method in the Study of Hadiths", *Journal of Islamic Studies* 5:1 (1994) pp. 1-34.
[39] Refer al-Qur'an, Surah al-Hujurat (49): 06.
[40] Muhammad 'Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1988), *al-Sunnah qabla al-Tadwin*, Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah, cet. 2, p. 223.
[41] *Ibid.*
[42] *Ibid.*
[43] *Ibid.,* p. 226.

of the *hadith* (appraise evidence and evaluate statements)[44]. It has demonstrated how thorough the *al-muhaddith* is in examining and investigating the sources of information and it is not that easy to simply accept what has been conveyed by a person of unknown background.

In the Qur'an Allah strongly emphasize the importance to investigate a matter before any decision is made on it[45].

﴿يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِن جَاءَكُمْ فَاسِقٌ بِنَبَإٍ فَتَبَيَّنُوا أَن تُصِيبُوا قَوْمًا بِجَهَالَةٍ فَتُصْبِحُوا عَلَىٰ مَا فَعَلْتُمْ نَادِمِينَ﴾

> Translation: "O you who have believed, if there comes to you a disobedient one with information, investigate, lest you harm a people out of ignorance and become, over what you have done, regretful"

The decision will not be based on speculation and wild assumptions without referring to the primary and authoritative sources. This is very important in ensuring that every *hadith* used in any field has the support and source of reference that is reliable and its accuracy is guaranteed. This will also ensure that a *hadith* that is used as an argument is one of the many *hadiths* that have been spoken by the Messenger of Allah, or it is simply created by certain tribes, such as the *Syi'ah* tribe, to achieve certain interests, whether personal, group, or schools of thought founded by them.

In fact, the *al-muhaddith* has pioneered a method of screening a *hadith* and it has become an example and a model to followers of Islam as the ethics in the acceptance of information currently. Decision has to be made, an information will only be accepted if it comes or derived from an individual from well known and distinguished background[46]. This approach is consistent with the approach that is being used by *al-muhaddith* in the generation of knowledge of criticizing *sanad*, that is,'*ilm al-jarh wa al-ta'dil*[47]. In these disciplines, is found the essence of critical thinking. The first is the method of analysis and evaluation carried out in an established manner on the weaknesses and mistakes that have been made by a reporter. This has been the focus of the *Muhaddith* to determine whether the information conveyed is acceptable. This method has been discussed at length in the first part of that discipline in the *al-jarh* section[48]. While the second method is a method to examine and evaluate the strength of a reporter including the strenghts, privileges and dignity of a reporter. This second method is the focus of the *Muhaddith* in the second part of the discipline in the *al-ta'dil* section[49].

---

[44] Evaluating evidence and statements (*appraise evidence and evaluate statements*) is one of the skills emphasized in critical thinking. See Fisher, Alec (2001), *Critical Thinking an Introduction*, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, cet. 1, p. 7.

[45] Surah al-Hujurat (49): 6.

[46] According to Syu'bah b. al-Hajjaj (160H), among the conditions for accepting narrations or news are Islam, intelligence, justice (*al-'adalah*) and strong memory (*al-dabt*). See Subhi al-Salih, Dr. (1959), *op. cit.*, p. 126.

[47] '*Ilm al-jarh wa al-ta'dil* or '*ilm mizan al-rijal* is a science that discusses the narrators from the point of view of accepting or rejecting their narrations *('ilm allazi yubhathu fi ahwal al-ruwat min haythu qabul riwayatihim aw raddiha)*. There were many companions who spoke about this science before it was written down, among them were, Ibn 'Abbas, 'Ubadah b. al-Samit, and from among the *al-tabi'in* was Sa'id al-Musayyab. The writing down of this science began in the 3rd century AH. Yahya b. Mu`in was the main pioneer in the writing down of this science. See Ahmad 'Umar Hasyim, Dr. (t.t), *al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah*, Cairo: Maktabah Gharib, p. 364-365; A'jjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1967), *Usul al-Hadith*: *'Ulumuhu wa Mustalahuh*, Lebanon: Dar al-Fikr al-Hadith, cet. 1, p. 261-262.

[48] Among the weaknesses of a narrator are not being fair and doing wicked things. See Subhi al-Salih, Dr. (1959), *op. cit.*, p. 133.

[49] Among the characteristics of a just narrator are istiqamah in religious matters, being protected from immoral matters and being protected from matters that can bring down one's dignity. *'Adalah al-Rawi* or the justice of a narrator can be known through two ways; first, his 'adil nature which is well known by the public, second, confirmation (*tazkiyyah*) of the just nature of a narrator made by another individual who is also 'adil. For further information please refer to, al-Razi, Abi Muhammad 'Abd al-Rahman b. Abi Hatim Muhammad b. Idris b. a-Mundhir al-Tamimi al-Hanzali (t.t), *al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Alamiyyah, vol. 1, pp. 1-3; see also Subhi al-Salih, Dr. (1959), *op. cit.*, p. 129; Muhammad A'jjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1967), *op. cit.*, p. 268.

Objective thinking is also emphasized in *takhrij hadith* activity, in which a person [the person performing the *takhrij al-hadith*] has to be objective in evaluating a *hadith*. This quality of objectivity is in the nature of fairness of the reporter that is strongly stressed in reporting the *hadith*. Al-Imam al-Shafi'ie stated a condition as a condition that should be given priority in the acceptance of a *hadith*[50]. The definition of 'feature' has been mentioned in discussion above. In short a reporter of *hadith* cannot be influenced by personal sentiments, national sentiments and be influenced by extremist nomadic tribe in making decision or to determine whether a hadith can be accepted. If ethics is practiced by the reporter of the *hadith*, so is the attitude to be adopted by a person involved in *takhrij al-hadith*. The desire to uphold this school of thought should not be a factor in weakening the strong *hadiths* or to strengthen the weak *hadiths*. The fanatic attitude of a figure in supporting a school of thought he likes should not be a factor to undermine continuous efforts at *takhrij al-hadiths*. This is because a bias against any group based on specific interests will not help in discovering the truth.

Islam, through revelation, strongly emphasizes that a person needs to be objective in evaluating a certain matter[51]. It is important to develop this attitude as a culture of the community, particularly so in scholarly endeavors, including efforts in *takhrij al-hadith*. The tendency to be not objective in such activities is in fact closely related to that person being overcome by the influence of lust and emotions, regardless of his background. Thus, these scholars have shown that there are a number of *hadiths* that have been forged by irresponsible groups just to show that the truth originates from the schools of thoughts founded by them. These are purely driven by emotion, besides to gain the support of the people.

Amir al-Sya'bi said, "None of the followers are being lied to such as lies that have been made on Sayyidina 'Ali[52]". Al-Imam al-Shafi'ie also said that: "I have never seen a person lied more than Rafidhah[53]". Meanwhile, Hammad b. Salamah too said, "A teacher from Rafidhah tribe who had repented reported the *hadith* to me. He said, "if we [Rafidhah] come together, then we evaluate that something is good, we make it a *hadith*[54]."

In the book *Nahj al-Balaghah*, Ibn Abi al-Hadid said that activities of telling lies about the *hadith* were related to the advantages (*fada'il*) and were first initiated by the *Syi'ah*. Lying about the *hadith* occurred because of political enmity of the tribes at that time. At the same time, the fanatical followers of Sayyidina Abu Bakr [known as al-Bakriyyah] also falsified the *hadiths* regarding previleges and strengths of Sayyidina Abu Bakr as a reply to the allegations made by the *Syi'ah* factions on Sayyidina Abu Bakr[55]. When al-Imam Malik was asked about *al-Rafidah*[56], he replied, "Do not talk to them and not to narrate *hadith* from them because they lie[57]".

---

[50] Manna' al-Qattan (1989), *Tarikh al-Tasyr'i al-Islami*, Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah, p. 79.

[51] Refer al-Qur'an: al-Nisa' (04): 58, al-Maidah (05): 08, al-An'am (06): 152, al-Nahl (16): 76.

[52] Muhammad 'Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1988), *op. cit.,* p. 196.

[53] *Ibid.*, p. 197.

[54] *Ibid.*

[55] *Ibid.*, p. 195.

[56] The group known as al-Rafidah refers to the *Shi'ah al-Imamiyyah*, who are called al-Rafidah because they reject Sayyidina Abu Bakr as the Imam or Caliph after the Prophet s.a.w. This sect is the largest among Shi'ah followers and is currently adhered to by about one-third of Iran's population. They are also known as *Ithna 'Ashariyyah* due to their belief in the twelve Imams, namely 'Ali b. Abi Talib, Hasan b. 'Ali, Husayn b. 'Ali, 'Ali Zain al-'Abidin b. Husayn, Muhammad al-Baqir b. 'Ali, Ja'far al-Sadiq b. Muhammad, Musa al-Kazim b. Ja'far, 'Ali al-Rida b. Musa, Muhammad al-Jawwad b. 'Ali, 'Ali b. Muhammad, Hasan al-'Askari b. 'Ali, and Muhammad b. Hasan. For further details, refer to Abi al-Hasan 'Ali b. Ismail al-Asy'ariy (1950), *Maqalat al-Islamiyyin wa Ikhtilaf al-Musallin*, Cairo: Maktabah al-Nahdah al-Misriyyah, 1st edition, p. 87, and Muhammad Abu Zahrah (n.d.), *Tarikh al-Madhahib al-Islamiyyah fi al-Siyasah wa al-'Aqa'id wa Tarikh al-Madhahib al-Fiqhiyyah*, Cairo: Dar al-Fikr al-'Arabiy, p. 47.

[57] *Ibid.,* p. 197.

Among the examples of fraud that was committed by them are:

وصي وموضع سري وخليفتي فى أهلي وخير من أخلف بعدي-علي

Translation: "The inheritor of my will, my secret place, my successor in my family, and the best person to succeed me is Ali[58] ".

من لم يقل علي خير الناس فقد كفر

Translation: "Anyone who does not say that` Ali is the best man, and he is an infidel[59]."

Mohd Hashim Kamali, while listing the false *hadiths* which discloses the bigotry of a person to a leader, also listed are examples of *hadith* reported by Hibban b. Juwayn, he allegedly heard that: "`Ali said that I and Prophet Muhammad were the first to worship Allah six years or seven years before anyone from among the followers pay obesiance to Allah." "From this *hadith,* it can be identified that Hibban b. Juwayn is a fanatic of the *Syi'ah* factions, and negligent in reporting the *hadith[60]*.

Fanaticism or extremism persists in a school of thought because humans are influenced by lust. Al-Imam al-Ghazali, in his book *al-Munqidh min al-Dalal*, said that those who strayed away from the path of truth, including the *Syi'ah,* prosecute only those who are in the right path, and there are the other groups (*firqah*) which are not true and deviated from the path of truth. It is not unusual because Allah had warned in His commandment[61];

﴿مِنَ الَّذِينَ فَرَّقُوا دِينَهُمْ وَكَانُوا شِيَعًا ۖ كُلُّ حِزْبٍ بِمَا لَدَيْهِمْ فَرِحُونَ﴾

Translation: "That is those who break up their religion [to hold on to vaious beliefs according to their desires] and they become several groups. Each group is proud of what is in their group." Surah al-Rum (30): 32.

Islam has taught its followers to reject an idea directed at desires. This is because thought that is based on common desires and disregards the potential of finding the truth will make a person seems blind and deaf[62]. Attitude inclined to follow a series of desires can plunge a person into a multitude of errors. Allah s.w.t. said in the Qur'an:

﴿يَا دَاوُودُ إِنَّا جَعَلْنَاكَ خَلِيفَةً فِي الْأَرْضِ فَاحْكُم بَيْنَ النَّاسِ بِالْحَقِّ وَلَا تَتَّبِعِ الْهَوَىٰ فَيُضِلَّكَ عَن سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ ۚ إِنَّ الَّذِينَ يَضِلُّونَ عَن سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ لَهُمْ عَذَابٌ شَدِيدٌ بِمَا نَسُوا يَوْمَ الْحِسَابِ﴾

---

[58] *Ibid*

[59] *Ibid.,* p. 198.

[60] Mohd Hashim Kamali (2002), *Hadith Methodology: Authenticity, Compilation, Classification and Criticism of Hadith*, Kuala Lmpur: Ilmiah Publishers, p. 110.

[61] Al-Ghazzali, Abu Hamid, (1988), *"al-Munqidh min al-Dalal", in Majmu'at al-Rasail al-Imam al-Ghazali*, edited by Ahmad Syams al-Din, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-'Ilmiyyah, ed. 1, p. 24.

[62] Al-Qaradawi, Yusuf, Dr. (1996), *op.cit.,* p. 252.

> Translation: "O David, We have made you a caliph (ruler) on earth, so make judgement between humans according to (*shari'ah* law) is true (which is revealed to you), and do not follow your desires, because they will lead you to go astray from the path of Allah. Indeed those who stray from the path of Allah, will be penalized heavily on the day of reckoning, because they forgot (the path of Allah) it".
> Surah Sad (38): 26.

Objective thinking also requires a fair and unbiased attitude in determining the validity of a *hadith*. A fair attitude is very important to incarnate. This attitude will encourage someone to support a *hadith* based on accurate sources of information and convinced of the position of the *hadis*. Fairness is very important because it is capable of revealing the truth, and a biased attitude adopted by some parties can obstruct the revelation of truth. The consequence of a biased attitude will eventually produce fanaticism or extremism in any school or group. Blind fanaticism as found in some of the proponents of a group or school, should not be practiced when a person is engaged in *takhrij al-hadith*. This is because it not only makes one tend to blame other groups with different views, but it will obscure the ultimate truth because fanaticism continues to overwhelm the person.

Through the method of *takhrij al-hadith* by examining the position of a *hadith* from the point of *matan* and *sanad*, one will be able to evaluate a *hadith* claimed to be an argument to support an opinion or a principle founded by certain parties. This method can be used with reference to the type or position of *hadith* that is being used, whether it is included in the *hadith* that is authentic, good and or even weak. The implementation of this method will reveal the status of a *hadith* that is being *takhrij* all at once to determine if it is suitable to be used as an argument. For example, the *hadith* which is said to be authentic by the proponents of *Syi'ah* and also used to back up their argument to confirm that Sayyidina Ali and the *ahl al-bayt* group only are eligible to become a leader after the death of the prophet ﷺ. However, after conducting the *takhrij* process, it is evident that these hadiths fall under the categories of *mawdu'* (fabricated) and *matruk*[63] (abandoned), which according to hadith scholars; are entirely unacceptable as supporting evidence in any argument. Despite this, due to tribal fanaticism, some individuals persist in asserting their position and continue to accept such statements, even though they are clearly false.

In fact, this tendency does not benefit the Muslims at all, and on the contrary it has led to discord and controversy among the Muslims because of this attitude of extreme fanaticism. This attitude also prompted the *Syi'ah* [for example] to accept only the *hadiths* reported by the reporters from among the followers of *Syia'ah Imamiyyah* who, in their opinion, is fair[64]. As for the *hadith* reported by reporters not in the *Syi'ah Imamiyyah* group in spite of the story being continued until it reaches Prophet Muhammad ﷺ, it will be rejected altogether. This is because, in the *Syi'ah* tribe, a story brought by followers of other sect other than the *Syi'ah* is not accpeted as *maqbul* (fit to be accepted)[65].

Critical thinking also stresses strongly on evaluation skills and in fact this aspect is among the main focus of critical thinking. These skills are not only emphasized by *al-muhaddith* earlier in the tradition of *hadith* collection and preservation in book form, this is also highlighted in the activities of *takhrij al-*

---

[63] A Hadith *Matruk* is a hadith narrated solely by a da'if (weak) narrator, where the reason for their weakness is an accusation of lying in hadith transmission, clear immorality in speech or actions, or frequent forgetfulness or negligence. See Fauzi Deraman (2005), *Pengantar Usul al-Hadith*, Selangor: Penerbit Salafi, p. 146.

[64] The Shi'ah group has rejected all hadith narrations from the Companions except for a few individuals among them. Al-Kulaini, who is regarded as the al-Bukhari of the Shi'ah, narrated in *al-Rawdah Min al-Kafi*, Volume 8, page 245, that the Companions had apostatized after the Prophet's passing, except for three of them: Miqdad b. Aswad, Abu Dhar al-Ghifari, and Salman al-Farisi. See Wan Zahidi b. Wan Teh, Datuk (2009), *"Bahaya Syi'ah Kepada Aqidah, Syariah, Akhlak, Ummah dan Negara"* (Paper presented at the *Seminar on Contemporary Islamic Thought Development*, 7 August 2009), organized by the Department of Aqidah and Islamic Thought, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya.

[65] Abdul Hayei Abdul Sukor, Dr (1995). "Hadis Sahih dan Mutawatir: Satu Perbandingan Antara Sunni dan Syi'ah Imamiyyah", *Jurnal Usuluddin*, No. 02; 91-92.

hadith. Particular attention to accuracy in evaluating a statement that is considered *hadith* is an important aspect in the practice of early *al-muhaddith*. In the evaluation process, questionnaire survey or investigation needs to be conducted to determine the accuracy of the information. For example, Ibn Syihab told a story from Qubasyah b. Zu'ayb, that a grandmother came to meet Abu Bakr, r.a. and the grandmother asked about the part of the heirloom she had the rigth to inherit. Then Abu Bakr r.a. said, "I find you have no part in the Qur'an and I do not know whether *Rasulullah* ﷺ give you the right to claim any part thereof". Then he asked the people. Al-Mughirah then got up and said: "I heard that the Messenger of Allah gave him 1 / 6." Abu Bakr r.a. then asked whether other people heard what you hear? Muhammad b. Maslamah confirmed that, and then Abu Bakr gave her the rightful amount[66].

That was the method used by Sayyidina Abu Bakr r.a. to evaluate and decide whether a message is actually coming from the Messenger of Allah. In the process of proving the accuracy of the information, he asked a witness who could verify the information. The same attitude was shown by Sayyidina 'Ali k.w. where he reportedly once said: "When I heard the *hadith* of the Messenger of Allah, Allah s.w.t. gave me the benefit. When other people presented a *hadith* to me, I would ask him to swear. After he has sworn, I would then accept the *hadith*[67]."

The skills that are emphasized in the evaluation of *takhrij al-hadith* can also be seen in the methods used by *al-muhaddith* in evaluating a *hadith*. For the purpose of evaluating the accuracy of the information in a *hadith*, the overall evaluation made by them on a network of reporters who are involved in reporting a *hadith*. This method, once and for all demonstrated that they are also reflective and critical in evaluating the story of a *hadith*. This is because this tactic, concealing the identity, character and background of the actual reporter, is often used by groups to fabricate the *hadith*[68]. A comprehensive evaluation of a reporter needs to be carried out, by including his biographical data such as full name, date and place of birth and death, and also the background of his life. This aspect is important and should be given due attention so that the background and personality of a reporter, and the group of reporters he belongs to, whether *thiqah* or *matruk,* can be determined. This is as stated by Mohd Hashim Kamali as follows:

> "By gathering all the hadith on a certain subject and other data
> relating to time, place and particular individuals and then carefully
> comparing the relevant parts with one another, the 'ulama' were able
> to evaluate the accuracy of hadith and reliability of their reporter[69]".

In addition, the evaluation process in *takhrij al-hadith* is also done in a holistic manner to identify the actual position of a *hadith*. For example, scholars involved in *takhrij al-hadith*, will not only look at the aspects backing a *hadith,* they will also examine the *hadith* from the point of *riwayah* and *dirayah*. This includes examining the narrators, or reporters involved in reporting a *hadith*. This will actually prevent someone from being over rigid or just imitate what has been presented by his teachers, either in writing or in conversations between him and the teachers[70].

In evaluating the authenticity and validity of the *hadith*, the scholars not only use the methodology of criticism of the *sanad* and the *matan* or text, but they also provide an assessment and analysis from the aspect of method of reporting. This method is known as *'ilm al-tahamul wa al-ada'*. It encompasses the

---

[66] Muhammad `Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1999), *op. cit.,* p. 147.

[67] *Ibid.,* p. 153

[68] Ismail Abdullah, Dr., "The Application of Critical Thinking in the Process of Jarh wa Ta'dil (Impugnment and Validation) of the Prophetic Hadith", International Conference on Creative and Critical Thinking from Islamic Persepectives,14-15 Disember 2005, International Islamic University Malaysia, p. 103.

[69] Mohd Hashim Kamali (2002), *op.cit.*, p. 116.

[70] See Siti Khairiah bt. Parmin (2007), *Critical Islamic Thought: An Analysis of the al-Muhaddithun Approach in the Acceptance of Hadith*, Master's Dissertation in Usuluddin, Department of Aqidah and Islamic Thought, Academy of Islamic Studies, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, pp. 109-116; see also Ibn al-Salah, Abi 'Amr Uthman b. Abd al-Rahman (1972), *'Ulum al-Hadith li Ibn al-Salah*, al-Madinah al-Munawwarah: al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah, 3rd edition, p. 114.

al-sama' method: a method of direct listening to *hadith*, *al-qira'ah* method: reading the *hadith* in front of the teacher, *al-ijazah* method: that is, the consent given by the teacher to the students to report the *hadith* owned by him to to be taught to others, *al-munawalah* method: the teacher delivers the books or manuscripts or records he obtained from his own resources, the *al-mukatabah* method: that is, writing the *hadith* to be given to others so that they it can be reported, and *al-i `lam* method: the notification about a *hadith* without stating whether the person who was told could report the *hadith*[71].

CONCLUSION

Having thoroughly studied the methods used by scholars in *takhrij al hadith*, it is evident that some of the skills emphasized in 'critical thinking skills', such as analytical skills, objective thinking skills and evaluation skills, exist in *takhrij al-hadith*. It also shows that the concept of critical thinking has also contributed to the maintenance and preservation of important Islamic knowlwdge, that is, the *al-hadith,* free from any form of alteration or forgery.

Notwithstanding the fact that critical thinking is derived from rational thinking (rational activities), nonetheless the objective is to find the truth. Thinking that arises from intelligence led by revelation is a special feature that is found to be with the followers of Islam only. Therefore, it should be manipulated as soon as possible, especially in generating advantages and benefits that can protect the religion from threats and attacks by the enemy, whether from inside or outside. This is consistent with the elements of critical thinking contained in the *'ilm takhrij al-hadith* as discussed previously. In short, the development of critical thinking in the discipline of '*ilm takhrij al-hadith* is expected not only to contribute to, and to ensure the validity and the authoritativeness of the *hadiths*, moreover it is hoped that it becomes a significant alternative in the effort to eliminate faked *hadiths* found in the body of Islamic knowledge.

---

[71] *Ibid.*

REFFERENCES

[1]   'Abdul Halim El-Muhammady (1992), *Islam dan al-Hadith : Dialog Bersama Kassim Ahmad ; Satu Aalisis ke atas Usaha-usaha Merosakkan Peribadi dan Autoroti Rasulullah s.a.w.,* (t.t.p), Angkatan Belia Islam Malaysia (ABIM), cet. 2

[2]   'Abd al-Rahman b. Muhammad, Ibn Khaldun (t.t), *Muqaddimah*, Beirut: Dar al-Jayl

[3]   'Abd al-Wahab Khallaf (1947), *'Ilm Usul al-Fiqh wa Khulasatu Tarikh al-Tasyri' al-Islami*, (t.t.p): Jordan, cet. 3

[4]   Abdul Hayei Abdul Sukor, Dr (1995). "Hadis Sahih dan Mutawatir: Satu Perbandingan Antara Sunni dan Syi'ah Imamiyyah, *Jurnal Usuluddin*, Bil. (02)

[5]   'Abu Bakr 'Abd al-Samad b. Bakr `Ali 'Abid, Dr. (1422H), *al-Madkhal ila Takhrij al-Ahadith wa al-Athar wa al-Hukm 'alaiha*, al-Madinah al-Munawwarah: (t.t.p)

[6]   Abu Hamid Muhammad b. Muhammad b. Muhammad, Al-Ghazali (1988), *Majmu'at al-Rasail al-Imam al-Ghazali,* suntingan Ahmad Syams al-Din, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, cet. 1

[7]   Abu al-Hasan 'Ali b. Ismail, al-Asy'ariy, (1950), *Maqalat al-Islamiyyin wa Ikhtilaf al-Musallin*, Kaherah; Maktabah al-Nahdah al-Misriyyah, cet. 1

[8]   'Abu Muhammad `Abd al-Muhdi bin `Abd al-Qadir (t.t), *Turuq Takhrij Hadith Rasul Allah s.a.w,* Kaherah: Dar al-'Itisam

[9]   Ahmad 'Umar Hasyim, Dr. (t.t), *al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah*, Kaherah: Maktabah Gharib

[10]   Ahmad Don Denffer (1981), *Literature on Hadith in European Languages: A Bibliography*, Leicester: The Islamic Foundation, h. 6.

[11]   'Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1967), *Usul al-Hadith: 'Ulumuhu wa Mustalahuh*, Lubnan: Dar al-Fikr al-Hadith, cet. 1

[12]   'Ali Zuwayn, Dr. (1987), *Mu`jam Mustalahat Tawthiq al-Hadith*. Beirut: `Alam al-Kutub & Maktabah al-Nahdah al-`Arabiyyah

[13]   Fisher, Alec (2001), *Critical Thinking an Introduction*, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, cet. 1

[14]   al-Tahhan, Mahmud, Dr., (t.t), *Taysir Mustalah al- Hadith,* Riyad: Maktabah al-Ma'arif.

[15]   Fauzi Deraman, Dr. (2001), *"Ilmu Takhrij al-Hadith, Pegertian, Sejarah dan Kepentingannya"*, *Jurnal Usuluddin*, Bil. 14

[16]   Ibn al-Salah, Abi 'Amr `Uthman b. `Abd al-Rahman (1972), *'Ulum al-Hadith li Ibn al-Salah*, al-Madinah al Munawwarah: al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah, cet. 3

[17]   Ismail Abdullah, Dr. (2005). "The Application of Critical Thinking in the Process of Jarh wa Ta'dil (Impugnment and Validation) of the Prophetic Hadith", *National Conference on Creative and Critical Thinking From Islamic Persepectives*, 14-15 Disember 2005, International Islamic University Malaysia.

[18]   Iftikhar Zaman (1994), "The Science of Rijal as a Method in the Study of Hadiths", *Journal of Islamic Studies* 5:1.

[19]   Majd al-Din Muhammad bin Ya'kub al-Fayruz Abadi (1987), *Qamus al-Muhith*, Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah

[20]   Majma' al-Lughh al-'Arabiah (1425H/2004M), *al-Mu'jam al-Wasit*, Mesir: Maktabat al-Shuruq al-Dawliyyah

[21]   Manna' al-Qattan (1989), *Tarikh al-Tasyri` al-Islami.* Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah

[22]   Mohd Hashim Kamali (2002), *Hadith Methodology: Authenticity, Compilation, Classification and Criticism of Hadith*, Kuala Lmpur: Ilmiah Publishers, h. 110.

[23]   Muhammad 'Ajjaj al-Khatib, Dr. (1988), *al-Sunnah qabla al-Tadwin*, Kaherah: Maktabah Wahbah, cet. 2

[24]   Muhammad Abu Layth al-Khayr Abadi, Dr. (2004), *Takhrij al-Hadith Nasy'atuh wa Manhajiyyatuh*, Kuala Lumpur: Dar al-Syakir

[25]   Muhammad Abu Zahrah (t.t), *Tarikh al-Madhahib al-Islamiyyah fi al-Siyasah wa al-'Aqa'id wa Tarikh al-Madhahib al-Fiqhiyyah*, Kaherah: Dar al-Fikr al-'Arabiy

[26]   Muhammad Fu'ad 'Abd al-Baqi (1996), *Mu'jam al-Mufahras li Alfaz al-Qur'an*, Kaherah: Dar al-Hadith.

[27]   Muhammad Mustafa al-A'dzamiy (1985), *Dirasat fi al-Hadith al-Nabawiy wa Tarikh Tadwinihi*, Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islamiy, j. 2

[28]   Nur al-Din `Itr, Dr. (1997), *Manhaj al-Naqd fi`Ulum al- Hadith.* cet. 3, Beirut & Damsyik: Dar al-Fikr al-Mu`asir & Dar al-Fikr

[29]   Nur al-Din 'Itr, Dr. (1976), *Mu`jam al-Mustalahat al-Hadithiyyah* . Damsyiq: Matba`ah Jami`ah Dimasyq

[30]   P.K. Koya, et.al (edit) (2000), *Hadith and Sunnah: Ideals and Realities*, Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, cet. 2

[31]   Razi, al, Abi Muhammad `Abd al-Rahman b. Abi Hatim Muhammad b. Idris b. a-Mundhir al-Tamimi al-Hanzali (t.t), *al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil*, Beirut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Alamiyyah, j. 1.

[32]   Siti Khairiah bt. Parmin (2007), *Pemkiran Kritis Islam: Analisis Terhadap Pendekatan al-Muhaddithun dalam Penerimaan Hadith*, Disertasi Sarjana Usuluddin, Jabatan Akidah dan Pemikiran Islam, Akademi Pengajian Islam, Universiti Malaya, Kuala Lumpur.

[33]   Subhi al-Salih, Dr. (1959*), 'Ulum al-Hadith wa Mustalahuh: 'Ard wa Dirasat, Beirut*: Dar al-'Ilm li al-Malayin.

[34]   Subhi Salih (1993), *Ilmu Hadith: Satu Pengenalan dan Kajian*. Terj. Ariffin Omar & Mohd Nor Ngah, Kuala Lumpur: Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka

[35]   Wael b. Hallaq (1997), *A History of Islamic Legal Theories; An Introduction to sunni Usul al-Fiqh,* United Kingdom: Cambridge Unversity Press.

[36] Wan Zahidi b. Wan Teh, Datuk, (2009), *"Bahaya Syi'ah Kepada Aqidah, Syariah, Akhlak, Ummah dan Negara"*, Kertas kerja *Seminar Perkembangan Pemikiran Islam Semasa*, 7 Ogos 2009), Kuala Lumpur: Akdemi Pengajian Islam Universiti Malaya.

[37] Yasin Dutton (1993), "Sunna, Hadith, and Madinan `Amal", *Journal of Islamic Studies* 4: 1.